Diversität im sozialräumlichen Kontext

In der Veranstaltungsreihe Migration, Gender und soziale Praxis des Forschungsverbundes FOSS in Kooperation mit dem CeSSt

Niki Edwards, QUT, Brisbane
Manuela Westphal, Universität Kassel
Monika Alisch, Hochschule Fulda

13. Dezember 2018
Complexity of Diversity

Migrants/Refugees

Unviseable Disability

Social Work Relationships
Unknown? Undesired?

Participatory Research
With „Inaccessibles“

Voice

Agency
Hassan and Bashir” – Australian refugees living with disability: Illustrating the importance of qualitative research methodology

Niki Edwards, School of Public Health & Social Work, Faculty Health, Queensland University of Technology, Australia

Diversität im Sozialraum - Zum Wandel professionell und zivilgesellschaftlich organisierter Sozialer Arbeit durch Zuwanderung (ProZiS)

Monika Alisch, Jens Vogler, HS Fulda, Department of Social Work and CeSSSt

Manuela Westphal, Anke Freuwört, Uni Kassel, Department of the Humanities, Institute of Social Work
A Case Study, “Hassan and Bashir” – Australian refugees living with disability: Illustrating the importance of qualitative research methodology


Niki Edwards BSoc Wk BArts MPub Admin PhD (Epidemiology) MAASW

Acknowledgements to Julie King PhD
AUSTRALIA... A BIG COUNTRY!
Background

- Australia is a **multicultural nation** & is the **most ethnically diverse country in the world**
- 26% of Australians are born overseas and 49% have at least one parent born overseas
- 100 religions and 300 ethnic groups in the cultural melting pot
- Australia has a **higher proportion of overseas-born people** (26%) than the United States (14%), Canada (22%), New Zealand (23%) & the United Kingdom (13%)

Thousands of refugees have sought asylum in Australia over the past decade, with the main forces driving movement being war, civil unrest and persecution. Australia is the only country in the world with a policy of mandatory detention and offshore processing of asylum seekers who arrive without a valid visa. Focus on economic wellbeing dominates Australian society.
Past 10 years: 138,628 people have entered Australia via the country’s refugee and humanitarian program (Department of Immigration and Border Protection 2013)

Between 2010 - 2014: 10,214 settled in Queensland (Department of Social Services, 2014)

Proportion of humanitarian entrants arriving with disability: unknown

Potentially high as a consequence of:
- human rights violations including torture
- environments of extreme poverty
- other hardships that may contribute to an increased probability of disability (Yang, Burr and Mutchler, 2012; Huang et al., 2011)
Background

• People from refugee backgrounds in Australia are not a homogenous group
• Disadvantaged at multiple levels in society (Taylor, 2004)
• Difficulties finding employment + may be exposed to stigma, discrimination and marginalisation (Colic-Peisker, 2009; Abdelkerim & Grace, 2012)
**Myth 1:** It is ILLEGAL to be an asylum seeker.

**FACT:** Everyone has the right to seek asylum if your life or freedom is threatened.

**Myth 2:** Asylum seekers are queue jumpers (especially those arriving by boat)

**FACT:** There is NO orderly queue

**Myth 3:** Most asylum seekers arrive by boat.

**FACT:** Up to 99% of asylum seekers arrive by air.

**Myth 4:** Asylum seekers bring disease and are a threat to security.

**FACT:** Comprehensive security and health checks are carried out (while claims of being a refugee are assessed on Christmas Island)

**Myth 5:** Boat arrivals are FAKE and are not real refugees

**FACT:** Between 70-90% of boat arrivals have been found to be refugees.

**Myth 6:** Boat arrivals hog all Australia’s refugee places

**FACT:** Successful applicants only make a small proportion of the total number of entrants each year.

**Myth 7:** Refugees receive higher welfare benefits than Australians

**FACT:** Refugees receive the SAME entitlements as other permanent residents.

---

In Australia, asylum seekers are unlawful non-citizens (Note: NOT Illegal) where their claims of being a refugee are assessed in a detention centre. Like Christmas Island!

Non-government organisations like the Australian Red Cross is under contract to DIAC for eligible financial assistance under the Asylum Seeker Assistance (ASA) Scheme.
Background

Compounded when people from refugee backgrounds resettling in Australia also live with disability

- Notably intellectual/cognitive impairment (intellectual/developmental disability)
- Limited international and Australian research into impact of disability on the resettlement experience of people from refugee backgrounds (Bogenschutz, 2014)
Background

Disabilities include:

- residual physical injuries from experiences of torture and trauma range from epilepsy (Harris and Zwar, 2005);
- visual impairments, brain injury (Bradley and Tawfiq, 2006)
- difficulties with mobility and walking (Foundation House, 2012)
- chronic pain (Prip, Persson and Sjolund, 2011)
- sexually transmitted infections (Harris and Zwar, 2005)

- In addition, may contribute to mental illness that can often be expressed as somatic symptoms which present as a disability (Rohlof, Knipscheer and Kleber 2014)
Why is disability neglected in refugee research?

- Refugee research and disability research are two fields of study where there has been little crossover in terms of theory or empirical inquiry (Albrecht, Devlieger and Van Hove, 2009)

- **Few studies conducted**: found that people from refugee backgrounds with disability likely to encounter the dual barriers of being both a person with a disability and a refugee simultaneously (Bogenschultz 2014; Mirza et al 2014; Harris 2003)

- No current studies that focus on intellectual disability were found

- Stigma directed at their race, nation or religion (Goffman, 1963), stigma directed at their disability and their refugee status

- Stigma experienced in home country as result of disability follows person with disability to resettlement country
Global North definitions are dominant – what about the Global South? **Assumption that western notions are universal**
Background

• Social and cultural constructions of disability, do not always align with Western understandings

• In addition to Global North dominance in definitions – also methodologies and researcher background

“Therefore, we should be reluctant to make false assumptions about people, behaviour, experiences, barriers and solutions based on previous work on disabled people from generally white, privileged, Western, Judeo-Christian societies” (Albrecht, Devlieger & Van Hove, 2009, 69)
Research Aims

- Explored personal stories of participants’ journey from their country of origin to Australia
- Constructions of disability in their country of origin
- Impact of disability on the participants and their families
- The support received from their community and mainstream community in Australia
- Knowledge of government entitlements and services in Australia
- Their experiences in this domain and areas where additional resources are needed
Research

- Qualitative research involving In-depth interviews conducted with 10 participants: *participants included people with disability or carer when informed consent could not be provided*
- Commenced with comprehensive critical literature review: *most disability literature focused on mental health, little attention explicitly paid to disability, including physical, sensory and intellectual disability*
- Data collection began in 2014 – project completed 2016
- Collaboration with AMPARO Advocacy Inc, including participant recruitment
- Ethical clearance from QUT Human Research Ethics Committee
## Participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region of origin</th>
<th>Number of interviews</th>
<th>Sex of those interviewed</th>
<th>Sex of person with disability</th>
<th>Person interviewed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sub-Saharan Africa</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4 female</td>
<td>3 male, 1 female</td>
<td>4 family carers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South-East Asia</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1 male</td>
<td>1 male</td>
<td>Person with disability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2 male, 2 female</td>
<td>3 male, 1 female</td>
<td>2 people with disability and 2 family carers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Asia</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1 male</td>
<td>1 male</td>
<td>Person with disability</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Interviews

The case study published & discussed here is draw from the n=10 interviews; illustrates the complexity of disability on the family with a refugee background

Data presented is from one family, “Hussan and Bashir”

- Interviews lasted up to 140 minutes, “Tell me your story”
- Interpreters were utilized in four interviews to ensure clarity of communication between the interviewer and participant
- Audio recorded with permission
- Data was transcribed verbatim and thematically analysed (cross-checked with members of the research team)
Participants

Participants identified as having a range of disability:
- Muscular dystrophy
- Severe hearing impairment
- Epilepsy
- Autism spectrum disorder
- Acquired brain injury
- Chronic pain
- Mobility impairments
- Intellectual disability
- Visual impairment
- Partial paralysis
- One participant stated that their family member had not received a definitive diagnosis, while other participants did not specify the nature of the disability directly.
Case study: Hussan and Bashir

• Born in the Middle East to a wealthy family
• Hussan (DOB 1992) was left with a “brain injury” after their house was bombed
• Bashir reported that his brother was in hospital for “a while” in a coma – the doctors told the family his only injury was some hearing loss
• However, the family noticed changes including being less responsive to them – they were unable to get a diagnosis in their country so searched for answers – finally got a diagnosis of “severe autism”
• As conditions got worse in their country Bashir and his mother left with the intension of sending for Hussan once they were settled somewhere else
• Hussan was left with a family known to Bashir, while in their care he was starved, physically restrained, tortured and drugged
Hussan and Bashir

- Bashir and his mother gained refugee status and arrived in Australia in 2015
- After many attempts and large amounts of money, Bashir arrived in Australia in 2007
- He was assessed by Queensland Government Disability Services in Brisbane, Australia and placed in residential care
- He was given a diagnosis of epilepsy and was on long-term anti-seizure medication – the family were convinced he did not have epilepsy, but they said: “And look at him now, he’s got a room, so it’s okay if they give him an extra tablet and this and this. So we accept things because we think, compared to where it was, wow.” (Bashir)
Hussan and Bashir

• However, as the family are busy with work and resettlement they felt their control over Hussan’s well-being and treatment deteriorated, “And things start to become even worse and worse, every time he comes into visit his Webster pack, that’s the packet where he takes his tablets from start to get bigger and bigger and bigger with more tablets and tablets. And um...and you know, they kept saying to us, his behaviour is really very challenging, his this and this.” (Bashir)

• Hussan spoke both English and Arabic, but the family believed this, plus his cultural heritage and the trauma he has experienced was not given any consideration
Hussan and Bashir

• “And things were getting really bad, and then they said they, things really got to the max when they said they were applying to the tribunal to get an order for a physical and chemical restraining” (Bashir)

• During this time there was no consultation between the service and the family

• “There are so many things happening with the service provider um... they changing the staff all the time and my brother is not used to that and he was scared of them because they changing and I tried to explain to them and they wouldn’t listen to me. I tried to teach them how to communicate with him they won’t listen to me.” (Bashir)

• Even though Bashir had worked as a disability support worker, he felt powerless and could not understand the system

• Both Bashir and his mother experienced high levels of stress and anxiety
Hussan and Bashir

• Bashir and his mother found the “system” difficult to navigate and understand (government and non-government services)

• Finally a legal guardian was appointed by the Office of the Adult Guardian leaving the family with very little control and feeling powerless

• A small advocacy agency at the time of the interview was advocating on the part of the family to move Hussan to another service and to re-negotiate legal guardianship
Larger Study Results

How government and non-government services functioned

- Participants had a general lack of understanding of the healthcare system and disability services
- Willingness at first just to accept what is given as it is “better than what we had before”
- Lack of understanding by the Government Services of the needs of people from refugee backgrounds with disability
- Lack of communication and knowledge between settlement services and disability services
- Lack of understanding of cultural differences, mostly put down to language
Findings

How government and non-government services functioned

Bashir compared his association with the NGO service provider to an abusive relationship: ‘.......they treated us so badly. I don’t know because we were a bit ignorant on how the system works and they could get away with many, many things and they just wanted to do just anything they want................I think they treated us very badly. And because, we went away with it, it’s like an abuse relationship’.
Zum Wandel professioneller und zivilgesellschaftlicher Sozialer Arbeit durch Zuwanderung

Diversität im Sozialraum
Verbundprojekt der Hochschule Fulda und der Universität Kassel
Prof. Dr. Monika Alisch, Prof. Dr. Manuela Westphal, Anke Freuwört, MA, Jens Vogler MA

Gefördert durch das Bundesministerium für Bildung und Forschung (BMBF)
Projektdauer: April 2018 - März 2020
Praxispartner: Zukunftsbüro, Stadt Kassel
Fachdienst Migration, Landkreis Hersfeld-Rotenburg
Ausgangslage 1

• Güte kommunaler Integrationsprozesse: Klima „integrativer Freundlichkeit“ (SVR 2012)
• Hohe Bedeutung von freiwilligem Engagement in Verbindung mit professioneller Sozialer Arbeit für das Gelingen von Diversität im Sozialraum
• Art und Intensität der sozialen Beziehungen von Zugewanderten und Einheimischen als Indikator für Zu- und Zusammengehörigkeitsgefühle
• Professionelle und alltägliche soziale Beziehungen befördern gesellschaftliche Teilhabe und Partizipation (Integration, Diversität)
• Wie verändern und lernen Gemeinwesen in unterschiedlich strukturierten Kommunen (städtisch und ländlich)?
Ausgangslage II

• Neues (altes) Anforderungsprofil in der Sozialen Arbeit: inklusive diversitätsorientierte Kompetenz in der professionellen Sozialen Arbeit

• „Anforderungsprofil“ im freiwilligen Engagement: Eigeninitiative, Autonomie, Eigenwilligkeit, semi/nichtprofessionalisierte Hilfe-/Sorgekonzepte

• Beziehungen und Verhältnisse zwischen professioneller und zivilgesellschaftlicher Sozialer Arbeit erscheinen unsicher und von wechselseitiger Abhängigkeit bestimmt

• Entwickeln sich professionelle und soziale Beziehungen zwischen (Neu)Zugewanderten und Einheimischen auf Augenhöhe („migrationsgesellschaftlicher Solidarität“ vgl. Broden 2014) oder paternalistisch?
Ziele

ProZiS untersucht die Rolle der professionell und zivilgesellschaftlich organisierten Sozialen Arbeit für das Gelingen von Diversität im Gemeinwesen

1. Identifizieren von institutionellen Veränderungen in der professionell und zivilgesellschaftlich organisierten Sozialen Arbeit mit Geflüchteten

2. Identifizieren von Beziehungsformen, Selbstverständnissen und Hilfekonzepten im Verhältnis zwischen Zugewanderten, Professionellen und Engagierten – im Hinblick auf die Aufnahme und Intensivierung interethnischer Kontakte

3. Präzision von Lerneffekten für die Akteure der relevanten Handlungsfelder der Soziale Arbeit
Methodik

Problemzentrierte, leitfadengestützte Interviews mit professionellen und zivilgesellschaftlichen Akteuren der Sozialen Arbeit.

Narrativ angelegte Einzel- bzw. Paarinterviews mit Migrant*innen/Geflüchteten, „befreundeten“ Einheimischen

Partizipative Interpretationen durch Rückkopplungen in Gruppendiskussionen

Praxiskonferenz zum Transfer der Ergebnisse in die Praxis
Zugänge

Stadt Kassel — Zukunftsbüro
Landkreis Hersfeld-Rotenburg — Fachdienst Migration

Professionelle der Sozialen Arbeit (ASD, MBE etc.)
„Ehrenamts-Koordinatoren*innen“
Zivilgesellschaftliche Soziale Arbeit (Engagierte, Pfarrer*innen etc.)
Migranten(selbst)organisationen

Identifizierung von möglichen „Beziehungs-Tandems“ aus Migrant*innen, Einheimischen
Zugänge zu "Beziehungs-Tandems"

Über Interviewpartner*innen aus dem Akteursfeld Soziale Arbeit mit/für Migrant*innen

Non-formale, nicht-professionalisierte Settings

Interethnische Kontakte und solidarische Freundschaften
“Beziehungs Tandems“

• **Wer?** Tandems, die über längere Zeit einen regelmäßigen und privaten Kontakt pflegen

• **Wer nicht?** Staatliche bzw. angeordnete Betreuungsverhältnisse

• **Wo?** Patenschaftsprojekte, Begegnungscafés, Musikgruppen, kirchliche Einrichtungen etc.
• Das Feld der professionellen, semi-professionellen und nicht professionell organisierten Sozialen Arbeit für und mit Migrant*innen/Geflüchteten ist im städtischen und im ländlichen Kontext sehr breit;

• Die hauptamtliche Organisation der Zuständigkeit für Themen der Migration und Integration bleibt im ländlichen Raum überschaubar

• Die Bereitschaft, sich im Rahmen unserer Forschung auf das Thema Diversität, (Zusammen)Arbeit für und mit insb. Geflüchteten ist grundsätzlich groß!

• Die Interviews deuten auf ausgeprägte Unsicherheiten und Vorbehalte, eigene Ansichten über Erfahrungen der Zusammenarbeit, der Migrationsgesellschaft und Geflüchtete, in der Forschung zu äußern.

(„... bitte streichen Sie das!“, „bitte verwenden sie mein Interview nicht!“ „ich weiß nicht, ob ich das sagen darf“)
Prozesserfahrungen II

• Hauptamtliche Sozialarbeiter*innen arbeiten in befristeten Arbeitsverhältnissen, die z. T. jährlich verlängert werden. Einige deuten außerhalb der Interviewsettings an, dass sie sich „umschauen“ (müssen).

• Projektpartner „Zukunftsbüro“ der Stadt Kassel wurde aufgelöst. Mitarbeiter*innen bearbeiten die Themen in anderen Abteilungen. Ist Migration, Integration von Zugewanderten ein zukunftsträchtiges Thema?

• Politische Bewertung des Themas zeigt sich in (Nicht-)Zuständigkeiten bzw. der Verortung des Themas Migration als Einzelaspekt in größeren Kontexten.

• Besonders der Projektcharakter in den Angeboten für Geflüchtete wird kritisiert, weil so die Effektivität von Angeboten und Strukturen verhindert werde.
Anschlüsse in Wissenschaft und Praxis

**Praxis**
- Leitlinien für gelingende Diversität in kommunalen und lokalen Integrationsprozessen

**Wissenschaft**
- Transdisziplinäre Praxisforschung in der Sozial- und Gemeinwesenarbeit
- Wandel der Sozialen Arbeit (Arbeitsteilungen, Hilfekonzepte)
- Soziale Beziehungen und Freundschaften (Bildung, Solidarität)

**Dissertationen**
- Professionell und zivilgesellschaftlich organisierte Soziale Arbeit mit Zugewanderten — Eine empirische Untersuchung von Arbeitsbündnissen in personenbezogenen sozialen Dienstleistungsprozessen unter Einbeziehung postkolonialer Perspektiven
- Auswirkungen von politischen Fluchterfahrungen auf den Lebensverlauf — Empowermentstrategien und -prozesse durch politisches Engagement